

Schiefner, Anton, *Übersetzungen aus dem tibetischen Kanjur: Beiträge zur Buddhismuskunde und zur zentralasiatischen Märchenforschung*. Hrsg. von Hartmut Walravens [Sinologica Coloniensia 25] (Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 2007), xli + 203 pp., € 68,00, ISBN 978 3 447 05508 6.

The work under review here reprints 55 stories translated by Anton Schiefner, mostly from Tibetan translations of Indian works, but also a few from Mongolian, and several verses composed in Tibetan. Originally, the works were published between 1860 and 1879. As the editor points out (IX), however, Schiefner's translations, published mostly in the *Abhandlungen* of the St. Petersburg Academy, were and remain generally unknown; the fame of his collection of tales came through their English translation by W.R.S. Ralston. It is probably not, or not wholly, the fact that they were written in German which caused their obscurity, but rather the inaccessibility of the journal in which they appeared. (It is remarkable that Maria Leitner in *Tibetanische Märchen* [misprinted *Tibetanischen* in n. 18, correct as item 162 in the *Schriftenverzeichnis*] [Berlin: Axel Juncker Verlag, 1923] translated the tales into German from Ralston's English!) Now, with their reedition (with orthography updated) in a handy, but unfortunately not very affordable, paperback, these translations may reach a new audience.

Given the fact that the English translation has been reprinted many times, and being out of copyright is now easily available on the web, a question any (at least any not native German speaking) scholar would ask is what the German version provides that is lacking in the English. To be sure, after a brief introduction this new book offers a comprehensive bibliography of Schiefner's publications. But the justification of the book must come from the translations. In this regard, I have noticed, from time to time, slight omissions in Ralston's English in comparison with the Tibetan being translated, and wondered whether that was due to Ralston's editing, or was present in the German from which he translated. Unfortunately, I kept no systematic notes of such things, and since the translations are generally very good, it is not easy to locate spots which seem to be abbreviated. However, at least in the case of the story of Utpalavarṇā, which I have recently studied ("The Story of Dharmaruci: In the *Divyāvadāna* and Kṣemendra's *Bodhisattvāvadānakalpalatā*." *Indo Iranian Journal* 51 [2008]: 139 ff.), it is now clear that the English translation is a literal rendering of the German, and whatever paraphrasing took place was the work of Schiefner himself in rendering the Tibetan. There are, however, two exceptions explicitly noted by Ralston. On p. 87 of Ralston's translation there is a note:

“A few lines have been omitted here.” These lines are to be found in the German (p. 163): “Während die Licchavis von Vaiśālī des Liebesgenusses wegen ihr Haus zu besuchen anfangen, verloren einige, welche zu stark in der Macht der Gewohnheit waren, sobald sie Âmrāpālī erblickten, ihre Lust, andere, sobald sie sie berührt hatten, so daß einige ihre Mannestat nicht ausübten. Da meinte sie, daß sie, weil jene keine Männer wären, durchaus eine Verkehrung treffen müsse.” We are fortunate that we now have access to the Sanskrit behind the Tibetan translated by Schiefner, a comparison with which is interesting (N. Dutt, *Gilgit Manuscripts* [Srinagar 1939–1959]: iii.2.18,18–19,3 [I did not check the facsimiles]): *vaiśālakā licchavayas tasyā grham praveṣṭum ārabdhāḥ paricārayitum | tatra keṣāmcid uttaptaviṭatvāt sahadarśanād eva rāgo vigacchati | keṣāmcit sparśanād eva kaścit tayā puruṣakāryam karoti | sā samlakṣayati | apumāṃsa ete | upāyasam-vidhānam kartavyam iti*. “The Licchavis from Vaiśālī began to enter her house in order to have sex with her. Some of them, because of their overwhelming passion, lost their lust as soon as they saw her, others as soon as they touched her, others when they did the deed. She thought: ‘These guys are eunuchs! I’ve got to do something about this.’” The omission of the passage suggests a bowlderization by Ralston. The other example is found on Ralston’s page 289, translating a passage on a brahmin youth, pupil of a caṇḍāla magician. The drunken master breaks his bed in the night: “The noise this made awoke the Brahman youth, who said to himself: ‘As the master is so restless in his sleep, I will support the bed with my back.’ Accordingly he propped up the bed with his back, and patiently held out all night [in spite of much discomfort] thinking that if he moved his body, or uttered a word, the teacher would hear the noise he made” Ralston’s note to his bracketed clause is “This passage has been slightly modified.” The German corresponding to the paraphrase (p. 84) has: “Nun ist es in der Ordnung der Dinge, daß die Kraftvollen unter den Trinkern ihres Rausches in der ersten Nachtwache ledig werden and so kam, es daß der Caṇḍāla durch die Wucht des berausenden Getränkes auf den Rücken des Brahmanenjünglings sich erbrach.” Here too through good fortune we have the corresponding Sanskrit (R. Gnoli, *The Gilgit Manuscript of the Saṅghabhedavastu*, part 2. Rome, 1978: 87.20–24): *māṇavaḥ śrutvā pratibuddhaḥ | sa samlakṣayati | upādhyāyaḥ duḥkham śaiṣyate | yan nu aham aṅganikāyām pṛṣṭham dattvā avasthitaḥ | dharmatā hy eṣā sauṇḍānām yo balavāms tasya vāntir bhavati | tasya prathame yāme madyam vigacchati | tena tikṣṇamadyavegāt māṇavasya pṛṣṭhe vāntam*. “When the brahmin youth heard [the crash] he woke up, and thought: ‘The teacher will sleep in dis-

comfort [since the bed is damaged]. Why don't I leave the edge of the bed [below which the legs have broken away] sitting on my back?' Now this is the way of the world for drunkards: the strong vomit. In the first watch of the night, his liquor left him; he vomited a stream of warm liquor over the back of the brahmin youth." A lovely image, to be sure, and likely to be uncomfortable, but still, it is not clear why Ralston would suppress the passage. As far as I noticed, no other passages are marked by Ralston as having been emended.

Franz Anton Schiefner (July 18, 1817–November 16, 1879) belongs to the generation of nineteenth century scholars whose fundamental contributions to our field have a tendency to be overlooked these days. His works include his important edition and translation of the history of Tāranātha, *Tāranāthe de doctrinae Buddhicae in India propagatione narratio*, 1868, and *Tāranātha's Geschichte des Buddhismus in Indien*, 1869. The editor emphasizes the importance of Schiefner's work for comparative folkloristics, but when he also claims for it an importance (alongside the work of Julien and Chavannes) for 'Ostasienwissenschaft,' one is constrained to ask in what way Tibetan translations of Indian stories are relevant for East Asia.

This is not the place to offer a full appreciation of Schiefner, which unfortunately the editor also does not provide. However, to perhaps make this work a bit easier to use, I append a concordance of the German translation with Ralston's English [titles as in the table of contents], the location of the original in the Vinaya section in the Peking Kanjur, and the entry for this in the extremely useful book of Jampa Losang Panglung (*Die Erzählstoffe des Mūlasarvāstivāda-Vinaya analysiert auf Grund der tibetischen Übersetzung*, Tokyo, 1981). The principle of ordering of these stories, which do not follow their order in the Kanjur, is not clear in this book, or in Ralston's.

- I. Über einige morgenländische Fassungen der Rhampsinit-Sage = IV The Clever Thief; *ca.* 127a [96–97]
- II. Indische Erzählungen und Künstleranekdoten.
 - Künstleranekdoten = L Artist Anecdotes
 1. Der Elfenbeinschnitzer und der Maler = The Ivory Carver and the Painter; *ge* 263a [52–53]
 2. Der Mechaniker und der Maler = The Mechanician and the Painter; *ge* 261b [51]
 3. Der Wettstreit zweier Künstler = The Competition between the Two Artists; *ge* 262a [51–52]

Erzählungen:

- 1 Mahauṣadha und Viśākhā = VIII Mahauṣadha and Viśākhā; *ne* 51b [191–192]
- 2 Śuśroṇi = XII Surśroṇi; *ne* 90b [193–194]
- 3 Kṛśā Gautami = XI Kṛśā Gautami; *ne* 117b [194–195]
- 4 Der stumme Krüppel = XIV The Dumb Cripple; *ge* 235a [46]
- 5 Der Schakal als Verleumder =XXXIII The Jackal as Calumniator; *je* 222b [135–136]
- 6 Ochsen als Zeugen =XXX The Oxen as Witnesses; *je* 211b [134–135]
- 7 Affen vom Tode gerettet = XLII The Monkeys Saved from Death; *ge* 106a [28]
- 8 Ādarśamukha = III Adarśamukha; *ge* 186b [39]
- 9 Der Pfau als Bräutigam =XLVI The Peacock as Bridegroom; *nge* 87b [67]
- 10 Die beiden Fischottern und der Schakal =XXXIV The Two Otters and the Jackal; *nge* 91b [67]
- 11 Bestrafte Habgier = XIX The Punishment of Avarice; *nge* 99b [68–69]
- 12 Die tugendhaften Tiere = XXIV The Virtuous Animals; *nge* 181a [78]
- 13 Rṣyaśṛṅga = XV Rshyaśringa; *ce* 131a [97–98]
- 14 Der Zauberlehrling = XX The Magician's Pupil; *ce* 163a [104]
- 15 Undank ist der Welt Lohn = XXVII The Ungrateful Lion; *ce* 171b [107]
- 16 Die beiden Brüder = XVIII The Two Brothers; *ce* 176a [108–109]
- 17 Wie eine Frau Liebe lohnt = XXI How a Woman Repays Love; *ce* 178b [109]
- 18 Viśvaṃtara = XVI Viśvaṃtara [*sic*]; *ce* 181b [109–110]
- 19 Die strafbaren Hunde = XXXIX The Guilty Dogs; *ce* 198a [111]
- 20 Die dankbaren Tiere und der undankbare Mensch = XXVI The Grateful Animals; *ce* 199a [111–112]
- 21 Ichneumon, Maus und Schlange = XXV The Ichneumon, the Mouse, and the Snake; *ce* 199b [112]
- 22 Die Krähe mit dem Goldmützchen = XLVII The Crow with the Golden Cap; *ce* 206a [113]
- 23 Der Schakal in den Elephantenspuren = XXXVIII The Jackal in the

- Elephant's Traces; *ce* 206b [113–114]
- 24 Die rachsüchtige Krähe = XLVIII The Vengeful Crow; *ce* 214b [115]
- 25 Die beiden zusammengewachsenen Fasanen = XLIX The United Pheasants; *ce* 215a [115]
- 26 Die erfüllte Prophezeiung = XVII The Fulfilled Prophecy; *ce* 215b [115–116]
- 27 Der Schakal rettet den Löwen = XXXV The Jackal Saves the Lion; *ce* 226a [118]
- 28 Der barmherzige Jäger = XLI The Gazelle and the Hunter; *ce* 226b [118]
- 29 Der bestrafte Schakal = The Elephant and the Jackal, in W.W. Rockhill in *JAOS* 18 (1897): 11–12; *ce* 227a [119]
- 30 Bestrafte Ungläubigkeit = XLIII Incredulity Punished; *ce* 227b [119]
- 31 Der weise und der törichte Affenanführer = XLIV The Wise and Foolish Monkey Chiefs; *ce* 228b [119–120]
- 32 Der heuchlerische Kater = XL The Hypocritical Cat; *ce* 229a [120]
- 33 Die störrischen und die willigen Ochsen = XXXI The Obstinate and Willing Oxen; *ce* 229b [120]
- 34 Die Affen und der Mond = XLV The Monkeys and the Moon; *ce* 230b [121]
- 35 Der blaugefärbte Schakal = XXXVI The Blue Jackal; *ce* 235b [121–122]
- 36 Der betrogene Elephant = XXVIII The Tricked Elephant; *ce* 236b [122]
- 37 Wolf und Schaf = XXIX The Wolf and the Sheep; *ce* 264a [123]
- 38 Der Esel als Sänger = XXXII The Ass as a Singer; *ce* 269b [124]
- 39 Der durch den Ochsen gehängte Schakal = XXXVII The Jackal Hanged by the Ox; *ce* 270a [124–125]
- 40 Die Flucht der Tiere = XXII The Flight of the Beasts; *je* 182a [142]
- 41 Der geprellte Schauspieler = XIII The Overreached Actor; *je* 208a [142–143]
- 42 Mahākāśyapa und Bhadrā = IX Mahākāśyapa and Bhadrā; *the* 25b [162–163]
- 43 Utpalavarṇā = X Utpalavarṇa; *te* 201a [159]
- 44 Die fünf Liebhaber = XXIII The Five Lovers; *the* 65a [164; not noted by Panglung!]

- 45 Der König Māndhātar = I King Māndhātar; *ge* 158a [35–36]
 46 Der Prinz Jīvaka als König der Ärzte = VI Prince Jīvaka; *nge* 47b
 [63]
 47 Viśākhā= VII Viśākhā; *nge* 69b [65]

Two stories available in Ralston's English book are not reprinted here:

- II. Kuśa Jataka; *ge* 177a [37–38] = Schiefner's *Awarische Texte* (1873), XLVI–L (144 in the bibliography)
 V. Sudhana Avadāna; *ge* 190a [39–40] = Schiefner's *Awarische Texte* (1873), XXVI–XLV, "Geschichte von dem Sohn des Pantschāla-Königs und der Tochter des Kinnara-Königs"

At the end of the volume we find several added translations, listed as Varia:

Über eine Indische Handschrift des India Office in London.

1. Der Tod der Elster.
2. Das Ulūka-Sūtra.

Zwölf Sprüche des Sakya Paṇḍita.

Drei mongolische Märchen.

1. Die Knotennase.
2. Der Gefräßige.
3. Der kluge Hase.

Finally, the editor has not indicated which items in his bibliography of 184 entries are reprinted here. His 102 is the "Drei mongolische Märchen," 103 "Zwölf Sprüche des Sakya Paṇḍita," 137 "Über einige morgenländische Fassungen der Rhampsinit-Sage," 152 "Künstleranekdoten," 153 "Erzählungen," and 157 is "Über eine Indische Handschrift des India Office in London."

JONATHAN SILK
Leiden University